

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Department of Summer Courses  and Special Programs | ה מ ח ל ק ה ל ק ו ר ס י ק י ץ  ו ת ו כ נ י ו ת מ י ו ח ד ו ת |

**Holy Places in the Holy Land: Conflict or Co-existence? (48849)**

**July 3-24, 2023, 09:00-12:00**

45 Academic Hours | 3 Academic Credits | 3 Field Trips

*Instructor: Professor Yitzhak Reiter*

[yr21995@gmail.com](mailto:yr21995@gmail.com)

Office Hours: By Appointment

Tentative Syllabus

**COURSE DESCRIPTION**

The course will study contested places as symbolic assets in Israel compared to case studies from other places in the world. The issues discussed would focus on the contested landscape in the Holy Land.

The case studies to be examined are: The Temple Mount/Al-Aqsa Mosque, the Church of the Holy Sepulcher, the non/Orthodox dispute over the Western Wall and the struggle of the Women of the Wall, the struggle for symbolic landscape in Nazareth: The Case of the Shihab al-Din Tomb/Mosque, The Tomb of Rachel, the Nachmanides Cave in Jerusalem, the Grand Mosque of Beersheba, the Mamilla Cemetery in Jerusalem, Cohabitation at the Tomb of the Prophet Samuel near Jerusalem, pilgrimage and competition over the public space - Mashhad Hussein in Ashkelon, and the conflict over the Temple Mount compared to the Ram Temple/ Babur Mosque in Ayodhya, India.

Our discussion will focus on challenging the hegemonic landscape as a spatial-social expression of a minority group that has formed its identity and is looking for ways to deal with the rule of the hegemonic majority and the processes of exclusion that the majority adopts. The alternative landscape that the minority group seeks to create is guided by a historical narrative that competes with the official history of the state and with the narratives of the majority. The course deals with the political essence of a landscape, the conditions under which the landscape, and especially the sacred landscape becomes an arena of dispute, and the characteristics of the conflicts over the design of the landscape and the manner of managing conflicts around it.

**OBJECTIVES**

The objective of this course is to provide students with a multi-faceted grounding in the historical context of and reasons for conflict or tolerance. It will enable them to identify and distinguish between different causes of conflict and avenues for settlement, as well as making them aware of the politicization of holy sites and sacred territory. They will be introduced to contesting narratives of parties to the conflict. In addition, the course will impart theoretical information that help students understand better the religious and cultural dimensions of intercommunal conflicts or tolerating the Other and will illustrate the interplay between religious and national dimensions of conflicts by examining relevant case studies.

**ANTICIPATED LEARNING OUTCOMES**

By the end of this course, students will have learned how to

1. Historically contextualize the religious symbolic dimension of the Israeli/Palestinian conflict;
2. Identify the central issues in a piece of historical and contemporary prose and critically assess authors’ arguments or interpretive schema;
3. Articulate their ideas on the interplay between religion and politics in the context of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict in the Middle East;
4. Develop an analytical approach by comparing between different case studies;
5. Develop a deeper understanding of how different faith traditions address conflicts, what the parameters for creating tolerance are in shared holy sites, and how religious symbols are being employed for political ends.

**METHODS OF DELIVERY**

This course will make use of different methods of study: lectures, electronic media inserts, field trips, and facilitated group discussions.

Regular attendance is vital to successful completion of the course.

**GRADING**

* Active participation is mandatory
* A five-page paper on one of the sacred sites the student will choose and its presentation in class (100%).

**EARNING GRADUATE CREDIT FOR THIS COURSE**

* Graduate students are expected to inform the Rothberg International School at [rissummer@savion.huji.ac.il](mailto:rissummer@savion.huji.ac.il) of their interest in earning graduate credits for their summer course(s).
* Graduate students must complete a **25-page, double-spaced, seminar paper** with a bibliography, instead of the course's standard final assessment. The students will discuss this paper in class. The topic and bibliography for these papers must be chosen in agreement with each course instructor. Students must approach course instructors by the end of the first week of the course and arrange a time to meet and define their paper topic and bibliography.
* The seminar paper must make use of at least five scholarly sources (books or academic articles), in addition to Internet resources.
* The graduate seminar papers must be submitted within 2 months following the course completion.

**COURSE OUTLINE**

1. **Introduction (3 July)**

* **Contesting Narratives of Holy Places**
* **The Tomb of Rachel: Change of Symbolic Landscape**

Readings:

* Hassner, R. (2009). War on Sacred Grounds. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, pp. 1-14.
* Hayden, R. (2002). “Antagonistic Tolerance,” Current Anthropology, Vol. 43, No. 2, pp. 205-231.
* Reiter, Y. (2018). “Mechanisms for Coexistence” in I. Finkelman et. al. (eds.) *In Status Quo: Structures of Negotiation*. Berlin: Hatje Cantz, pp. 43-53.

# **The Conflict over the Nachmanides Cave in Jerusalem (4 July)**

* **Cohabitation at the Tomb of the Prophet Samuel near Jerusalem**

Readings:

* Reiter, Y. (2017). *Contested Holy Places in Israel-Palestine: Sharing and Conflict Resolution* (London and New York: Routledge), pp. 121-131;264-279.

# **The Dispute over the Opening of the Grand Mosque of Beersheba and Hasan Bey in Jaffa in a Comparative Perspective to Cyprus and Germany (5 July)**

Readings:

* Allievi, S. (2010). Conflicts over Mosques in Europe:
* <https://stefanoallievi.it/libri/conflicts-over-mosques-in-europe-policy-issues-and-trends/>
* Strohmeier, Martin: “Omeriye: A Mosque in Nicosia”, *Journal of Muslims in Europe* 4, 2015, 58-69.
* [Hayden, R. M.](https://pitt.academia.edu/RobertMHayden?swp=tc-au-2546972)  Hande Sözer,  [Tuğba Tanyeri-Erdemir and Aykan Erdemir (2011)](https://metu.academia.edu/HandeSozer?swp=tc-au-2546972) “The Byzantine Mosque at Trilye: A Processual Analysis of Dominance, Sharing, Transformation and Tolerance” in *History and Anthropology*,Vol. 22, No. 1, March 2011, pp. 1–17.

# **Field Trip\* (10 July, 08:00-12:30)**

# Rachel Tomb, Samuel Tomb, Tomb of Simon the Just and Nachmanidess Cave, Mamilla Cemetery

1. **Cemeteries as an Arena for the Struggle for Identity through Landscape: The Case of the Mamilla Cemetery in Jerusalem and the al-Is`af cemetery in Jaffa (11 July)**

Readings:

* Santime, S. (2018), Controversy and Conflict over Cemeteries and Burials in Wolaita, South western Ethiopia.
* *International Journal of Sociology and Anthropology,* Vol. 11, pp. 1-17.

1. **Sharing of the Sacred Space in The Cave of the Patriarchs Compared to the Saint Tombs in India (12 July)** Guest lecturer – TBD

Readings:

* Bigelow, A. (2010). *Sharing the Sacred: Practicing Pluralism in Muslim North India*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 195-238.

1. **Field Trip Jerusalem\* (13 July, 07:00-13:00)**: Old City - Temple Mount, Western Wall, Holy Sepulcher, City of David, Mt Zion’s David Tomb and Last Supper Room

* **Status quo in Holy Places as a Tool for Preserving the Symbolic Landscape.**
* **The Cases of the Church of the Holy Sepulcher and the Temple Mount**

1. **The Struggle for Symbolic Landscape in Nazareth: The Case of the Shihab al-Din Tomb/Mosque (17 July)**

Readings:

* Reiter, Y. (2017). *Contested Holy Places in Israel-Palestine: Sharing and Conflict Resolution* (London and New York: Routledge), pp. 132-155.

1. **Pilgrimage and Competition over the Public Space - Mashhad Hussein in Ashkelon (18 July)**

Readings:

* Friedland, R., & Hecht. R. D. (1996). The power of place: The pilgrimage to Nebi Musa and the origins of Palestinian nationalism. In S. J. Denning-Bolle, & E. Gerow, (Eds.). *The persistence of religions: Essays in honor of Kees W. Bolle* (pp. 337-359.). Malibu: Undena Publication.
* Reiter, Y. (2017). *Contested Holy Places in Israel-Palestine: Sharing and Conflict Resolution* (London and New York: Routledge), pp. 228-243

1. **Field Trip\* (19 July, 08:00-12:30):** Cave of the Patriarchs in Hebron or Ein Karem churches and Abu Ghosh Mosques and Churches.
2. **The conflict over the Temple Mount Compared to the Ram Temple / Babur Mosque in Ayodhya, India (24 July)**

Readings:

* Friedland, R. & Hecht, R. (1998) “The Bodies of Nations: A Comparative Study of Religious Violence in Jerusalem and Ayodhya,” *History of Religions*, 38.2 (November, 1998). pp. 101-149.
* Hassner R. 2003. “To Halve and to Hold": Conflicts over Sacred Space and the Problem of Indivisibility”. In «Security Studies» 12(4), pp. 1-33.

**Comparative summary and discussion of tools for containing and resolving conflicts over competitive spaces in the symbolic and sacred landscapes**

\*All field trips are subject to change

**BIBLIOGRAPHY**

|  |
| --- |
| Hassner, R. (2009). War on Sacred Grounds. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, pp. 1-14.  Hayden, R. (2002). “Antagonistic Tolerance,” Current Anthropology, Vol. 43, No. 2, pp. 205-231.  Reiter, Y. (2018). “Mechanisms for Coexistence” in I. Finkelman et. al. (eds.) In Status Quo: Structures of Negotiation. Berlin: Hatje Cantz, pp. 43-53. |
| Reiter, Y. (2017). Contested Holy Places in Israel-Palestine: Sharing and Conflict Resolution (London and New York: Routledge), pp. 228-243 |
| Allievi, S. (2010). Conflicts over Mosques in Europe:  <https://stefanoallievi.it/libri/conflicts-over-mosques-in-europe-policy-issues-and-trends/>  Strohmeier, Martin: “Omeriye: A Mosque in Nicosia”, Journal of Muslims in Europe 4, 2015, 58-69. |
| Bigelow, A. (2010). Sharing the Sacred: Practicing Pluralism in Muslim North India, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 195-238. |
| Hassner, R. E. (2009). The pessimist’s guide to religious cooperation. In M. J., Breger, Y., Reiter. & L. Hammer (Eds.), Confrontation and co-existence in holy places: Religious, political and legal aspects in the Israeli-Palestinian context (pp.145-157). London and New York: Routledge. |
| Albera D. and Couroucli M. 2012.Sharing sacred spaces in the Mediterranean: Christians, Muslims, and Jews at shrines and sanctuaries. Indiana University Press: Bloomington, pp. 16-30.  Hayden R. 2002. “Antagonistic tolerance: Competitive sharing of religious sites in South Asia and the Balkans”. In «Current Anthropology» 42(2), pp. 205-31. |
| Friedland, R., & Hecht. R. D. (1996). The power of place: the pilgrimage to Nebi Musa and the origins of Palestinian nationalism. In S. J. Denning-Bolle, & E. Gerow, (Eds.). The persistence of religions: Essays in honor of Kees W. Bolle (pp. 337-359.). Malibu: Undena Publication.  Reiter, Y. (2017). Contested Holy Places in Israel-Palestine: Sharing and Conflict Resolution (London and New York: Routledge), pp. 228-243 |
| Friedland, R. & Hecht, R. (1998) “The Bodies of Nations: A Comparative Study of Religious Violence in Jerusalem and Ayodhya,” History of Religions, 38.2 (November, 1998). pp. 101-149.  Hassner R. 2003. “To Halve and to Hold": Conflicts over Sacred Space and the Problem of Indivisibility”. In «Security Studies» 12(4), pp. 1-33. |